

THREE KINGS QUARRY SITE LIAISON GROUP MEETING

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON MONDAY 22ND SEPTEMBER 2014 AT THE WAIKOWHAI ROOM, FICKLING CONVENTION CENTRE, COMMENCING AT 7.00 PM

PRESENT:

Winstone Aggregates Attendees:

Tony Carpenter, Andrea Cave, Chris Edmonds, Elyse LaFace, Daniel Le Roux, Mike Harris

Fletcher Building Attendees:

Bernie Chote, Fletcher Developments (General Manager), Steve Evans, Fletcher Building (Chief Operating Officer – Housing)

Elected Representative Attendees:

Councillor Cathy Casey, Albert-Eden-Roskill
Michael Wood, Puketapapa Local Board
Julie Fairey, Puketapapa Local Board

Auckland Council Attendees:

Steve Pearce, Team Leader, Monitoring & Compliance

Residents and Interested Parties (that signed on to the Attendance Register):

Richard Aitken, Rob Aerts, Professor Dick Bellamy (South Epsom Planning Group), Rosemary Bellamy, Garry Bryant (Three Kings United Group), Lloyd Cairns, Logan Cairns, Nigel Cartmell, John Cavanagh, Chris Dunn, Peter Elliott, Allan Kirk, Allen Kirk, Colleen Koller, Siew Lian Lim, Greg McKeown, Chris Mules, Pip Mules (South Epsom Planning Group), Vivian Naylor, Roz Smith, Dawn Taylor, Eve Teo, Kait Teo, Hugh Thomson, Pat Thomson, Fiona Tiny, Margaret Ting, Ann Weaver, Graeme Wrack, John White, Chrissie Wright. More were in attendance but did not sign the register.

David Towle (Chairperson/Facilitator)
Sandra Kelly (Minute Taker)

1. WELCOME BY CHAIR

David Towle introduced himself to attendees, adding that it was his second Meeting as Chairperson.

2. APOLOGIES

Harry Doig (Puketapapa Local Board) Robyn Duke, Mary Ann White.

Moved: D. Towle, THAT the Apologies be accepted.

Carried

3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

Moved: J. White, Seconded: P. Mules, THAT the Minutes of the Meeting dated 26th May 2014 be accepted as a true and accurate record.

Carried

4. MATTERS ARISING / ACTION ITEMS

A summary of actions from the previous meeting Minutes were listed on the back of the Revised Agenda which was available at the commencement of the meeting. Each item was reviewed with the following noted:

Action (held over) – Michael Wood to follow up with Nigel Turnbull regarding investigating with Council Officers safety of the Mt Eden Rd / Mt Albert Rd intersection.

M. Wood advised that N. Turnbull had sent a fairly detailed response to Winstone Aggregates. E. LaFace summarised the response being Auckland Transport had undertaken an investigation of the intersection and as a result they have lengthened the timing of the right turn signal from Mt Albert Rd to Mt Eden Rd.

Action 1 – Details of the Gardeners' schedule to be provided.

This action is to be addressed under the Quarry and Fill Operations Report.

Action 2 – Review of the state of the oak trees along Mt Eden Bund.

The oaks have been assessed in poor condition but removal will be considered under the future development of the site.

G. Bryant raised that consideration should be given to removing the trees now. D. Le Roux responded that the trees were not considered a safety issue, however G. Bryant replied it would be good to have the problem addressed now from a visual perspective.

Action 3 – Reliability of measurement in groundwater monitoring.

S. Pearce noted that through his discussion with Council Officers it is not a requirement of the consent nor standard practice on other consents the Council monitor to include this information. D. Bellamy responded that this is not best practice and casts doubt on what is provided.

Action 4 – Make available the slope stability report.

A slope stability report is to be made available in the plan change application.

D. Bellamy responded that the report has been requested and has not be provided. It is delaying tactics and unreasonable to withhold this information and shows the state of play. D. Towle asked if we can leave this action to which D. Bellamy stated that there was no choice.

Action 5 – Details of monthly fill volumes to be provided.

These volumes are now included in the Quarry and Fill Operations Report.

Action 6 – The request from the Group to have relevant senior management in attendance.

D. Towle noted that Steve Evans (Fletcher Building, Chief Operating Officer – Housing) was present.

Action 7 – Provide the available plans of the two options to Councillor C. Casey.

C. Casey confirmed receipt.

5. PUBLIC FORUM

D. Towle reiterated that advance notice of items for discussion under the Public Forum section is requested so that they can be added to the Agenda. However, he asked if there were any items raised from the floor and the following were provided:

- Possum Season
- South Western Corner Works
- Private Plan Changes
- Compaction Plan

D. Towle asked that each of these items get covered throughout the course of the meeting.

G. Bryant commented that no Agenda had been emailed to residents, and E. LaFace responded it was available on the website but it had not been emailed out. It was agreed, that a draft agenda will be emailed/posted with the meeting invitation and a summary of actions from the previous meeting 2-3 weeks prior to the each meeting.

Action 1: E. LaFace

6. SITE MONITORING REPORT

M. Harris, Engineering Geologist, presented the site monitoring report (a copy of which is on the company's website).

Points of discussion include:

- G. Bryant remarked that there was a lot of water in the site, and M. Harris replied this was due to recent heavy rainfalls.

- On Slide 21, M. Harris explained the differential settlement alarm at points AP80, AP92 and AP93. He noted that the middle mark is moving upwards as a result of some sort of disturbance in the pavement (i.e. the footpath buckling). D. Bellamy said he had inspected that point himself and was not happy with the explanation provided, as it is an assertion and not a fact. He stated that this needs to be taken very seriously by both Winstone Aggregates and Council.
- A resident queried the soundness of a retaining wall on the corner of St Andrews and Mt Albert Roads. M. Harris replied the marks in this area are not showing differential settlement. The resident asked if anybody had raised it with the school, and M. Harris replied that Winstone had not as there was no reason for them to. It was requested that this be noted in the minutes.
- D. Bellamy queried the last statement on Slide 57 “Cessation of settlement has been recorded since September 2005”. M. Harris noted that this had been met in terms of the definition of cessation of settlement as detailed explicitly in the consent.
- P. Mules asked if Winstone Aggregates will continue to pump once the site is full. M. Harris replied that pumping currently holds the water level at just above RL34m and should pumping stop the groundwater level will rise to approximately RL57m.

7. QUARRY AND FILL OPERATIONS

Daniel Le Roux and Elyse LaFace presented the quarry and fill operations report (a copy of which is on the company’s website).

Points of discussion include:

- Currently quarrying has stopped and Winstone is selling existing stock as well as importing products from other quarries to on-sell. It was queried if the imported material needed to be broken down any further to which D. Le Roux replied that it did not.
- The works within the south-west corner are in preparation to fill the area.
- D. Le Roux reported the number of possums caught since last meeting was 13. A. Weaver requested more frequent baiting to increase this number.

Action 2: D. Le Roux

- C. Mules asked if the planting along the western boundary was congruent with the Private Plan Change, and then asked what was being planted. P. Mules added why it has been done after all these years. D. Le Roux replied that it needed to be done and that mainly flax had been planted.
- G. Bryant queried the location of boundary pegs in relation to south west corner of the quarry. D. Le Roux replied that the boundaries are based on specific coordinates which a surveyor went out and pegged the north-west corner so as to define the boundary between the quarry and Kennards Storage. G. Bryant requested that the Meeting know where the boundaries are, and that they be defined and pegged.

Action 3: D. Le Roux

- G. Bryant asked what conversion rate was used to convert volume of fill in tonnes to cubic meters. C. Edmonds replied that it depended on the material but on average it was 1.9 tonnes per cubic meter.
- Resident asked where the fill was coming from and was told from all over Auckland. D. Le Roux added the material was being stockpiled and would then be placed and compacted. D. Bellamy asked why Winstone Aggregates were doing that now and G. Bryant added that the Group be privy to company documents regarding the decision to now compact material. C. Mules also asked for the rationale on this decision and why the plan had changed. B. Chote, previous General Manager of Winstone Aggregates, said with regards to the performance standard there are a variety of methods that will achieve this which is laid out in the Consent. D. Bellamy replied that it was not laid out in the Consent and was not agreed upon at the Environment Court Hearing which he had attended, and that only the top 5 metres of the fill must be compacted. B. Chote stated that the consent left us to choose the method to achieve the standard.
- E. LaFace concluded the quarry and fill operations report by detailing the incidents/complaints received since the last meeting. D. Taylor said non-Winstone trucks are still arriving at the site with uncovered loads. D. Le Roux replied that as long as their load is secured, then it does not need to be covered, to which D. Taylor responded if Winstone trucks cover their loads, why can't others. The ruling is that loads be secure. D. Towle suggested D. Taylor takes this up with the authorities as this is an ongoing concern to residents who feel that noting it at these Meetings is not getting the response. C. Mules responded that is putting the onus on the individuals of the Group when Winstone can do more.

8. GENERAL BUSINESS

D. Towle read to the Meeting the Resolution on Page 6 of the Minutes of Meeting held on 26th May 2014 regarding existing and future use of the site under the RMA; a copy of which follows:

Moved: Professor Dick Bellamy, Seconded: Mary Ann White, THAT this meeting expresses its dissatisfaction and deep concern at the lack of consultation undertaken by Fletcher Building and its subsidiary operating units concerning the management and future end use of the Three Kings Quarry. This meeting calls upon senior Fletcher management to clarify its internal reporting lines and identify clearly the roles and responsibilities of its various employees so that the community can unequivocally identify to whom its serious concerns should be addressed. This meeting further calls senior management to attend the next and future meetings of this Group to hear and discuss all concerns in order to meet obligations and consultation for existing and future use under the RMA.

Carried

S. Evans, Fletcher Building Chief Operating Officer – Housing, introduced himself to the attendees. He stated that the press, over the last week, have reported on the proposed end-use of the site. He added he was happy to address some of the concerns, but today will not serve as a presentation on the proposed end-use.

S. Evans stated that Fletcher Building have lodged two Private Plan Change requests, and the documents will be available when notified by Auckland Council in approximately two weeks' time. He was asked if it is still running in conjunction with the Unitary Plan, to which he replied that it is running in parallel.

D. Bellamy queried the intentions of an application under the Special Housing Area Act and if it would be for the entire site. S. Evans advised that tenancy agreements for the land along Mt Eden Road that is owned by the company come to an end in the next 18 months and there is no plan to renew these and the Special Housing Area would apply just to this area.

S. Evans stated the need to engage with the community. C. Mules queried what the consultation process is. S. Evans responded that nothing has been structured and ask for suggestions. To which a number of residents noted that they had inputted into the precinct plan and C. Mules specifically asked if the private plan change is the same as that which is in the precinct plan. S. Evans responded that it respects the precinct plan.

G. Bryant added that Winstone Aggregates have not consulted with the interested parties; there has been no consultation whatsoever. A resident said that S. Evans does not have the full story or background on the site, and the Consent was to fill the site to the top.

It was again queried from the Group what are the future plans for consultation. To which S. Evans responded that invitations will be provided to interested parties to discuss the issues. It was asked if he was prepared to revise the design, and S. Evans responded that it is always evolving.

G. Bryant then asked why S. Evans did not sit down with the residents and the community to engage them in the discussions prior to submitting the private plan change, adding that Fletchers will always go and do what they want to do.

D. Bellamy then thanked S. Evans for attending the Meeting and being positive, but the level of trust is not high and there are very good reasons for that being the case going back 25 years, but this has got far worse in the last 5 to 7 years. Regarding the Resolution at the last Meeting, he queried the level of confusion as to what the lines of authority are within the company. S. Evans replied that he sits on the Executive Committee of Fletcher Building so the responsibility is his; as a member of the executive committee he is accountable for the fill levels and the private plan change applications for the site.

It was raised that there was a lack of information to date. S. Evans stated that there will be a link to all the documents once notified on the website: www.Three-Kings.co.nz.

G. McKeown thinks it would be helpful for the community to understand about consultation. He feels we should talk about things which have happened in the past and added Judge Smith in the Environment Court asked for a final contour plan and this was provided. That is where the expectation was set. He said that the plan to fill to a lower level happened in secret. Residents were not made aware of that change. S. Evans responded that we need to focus on going forward and he believed the new outcome (15m below Mount Eden Road) is the right one. As it provides sight line protection, a density solution more in line with the Council plans, a better urban design plan (no more than 3-4 stories) and opening more sight lines.

In terms of the process of consultation, a resident read out Condition 77 of the Environment Court decision along with the time periods involved in the process – and asked if these had been complied with. S. Evans stated that we believe we have. It was then added that S. Evans has been misled in this regard. D. Bellamy suggested S. Evans takes the time to read through the files which underpin this situation. He added the level of trust has been greatly reduced.

M. Wood thanked S. Evans for coming tonight and he noted that that the final precinct plan is not quite complete but will be finalised and circulated soon.

J. Fairey (chair of the Local Board) stated if it was believed that consultation has happened through the precinct plan process that the Board are explicitly stating that it has not.

Councillor Casey asked how S. Evans could tell her, as a Councillor, about Council land swaps as he has stated in the media today. S. Evans replied that two options have been submitted: one solely within land owned by the company and the other which include Council land. Councillor Casey again queried how he could do that when permission was not provided. S. Evan responded that anybody by law can put forward a proposed private plan change for consideration.

G. McKeown queried the number of dwellings and what the figures were for the two options. S. Evans stated that the numbers between the two options are not substantially different.

R. Smith queried the timing for consultation.

S. Evans noted that consultation will continue to be separate to these Winstone SLG meetings which are focused on daily operations.

D. Bellamy asked if the Chair of the Local Board could act as the coordinator of the consultation and mediate a forum for discussions. A number of residents commented that the Local Board had acted very well in the past in representing the community.

Councillor Casey remarked that Megan Tyler, Council Planner, is available to answer questions, but unfortunately she was unable to attend tonight's Meeting.

D. Towle thanked S. Evans for attending tonight's Meeting.

9. NEXT MEETING

D. Towle asked the Group if they wanted the next SLG Meeting prior to Christmas, or wait until February 2015. The date of Monday 23 February 2015 was agreed.

Monday 23rd February 2015, 7.00 pm

Meeting declared closed at 9.20 pm

For more information visit the Winstone Aggregates website www.winstoneaggregates.co.nz
Select <Quarries><Auckland><Three Kings> or go straight to
www.winstoneaggregates.co.nz/Auckland.php?location=Three%20Kings