

THREE KINGS QUARRY SITE LIAISON GROUP MEETING

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON MONDAY 31ST AUGUST 2015 AT THE LYNFIELD ROOM, FICKLING CONVENTION CENTRE, COMMENCING 7.00 PM

PRESENT:

Winstone Aggregates / Fletcher Attendees:

Chris Edmonds, Mike Harris, William Hay, Angela Klein, Sandra Kelly (Minute Taker)

Elected Representative Attendees:

Harry Doig, Puketapapa Local Board

Auckland Council Attendees:

Steve Pearce, Team Leader, Monitoring & Compliance

Residents and Interested Parties:

Professor Dick Bellamy (South Epsom Planning Group), Garry Bryant (Three Kings United Group), Robin Duke, Stephen Evans, Graeme Mulholland, Patsy Sim, Dawn Taylor

David Towle (Chairperson/Facilitator)

1. WELCOME BY CHAIR

David Towle introduced himself to attendees, and advised the format of the meeting.

He pointed out a staff change, with Elyse LaFace leaving Winstone Aggregates, and then introduced her replacement Angela Klein, in the role of Environmental Fill Specialist.

2. APOLOGIES

Alan Bigelow, Councillor Cathy Casey (Albert-Eden-Roskill), Andrea Cave (Winstone Aggregates), Lee Corrick (Albert-Eden Local Board), Julie Fairey (Puketapapa Local Board Chair), Councillor Christine Fletcher, Pip Mules (South Epsom Planning Group).

Moved: D. Towle, THAT the Apologies be accepted.

Carried

3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

Moved: C. Edmonds, Seconded: D. Towle, THAT the Minutes of the Meeting dated 18th May 2015 be accepted as a true and accurate record. **Carried**

4. MATTERS ARISING / ACTION ITEMS

A summary of actions from the previous meeting Minutes were outlined as follows:

Action 1 – C. Edmonds to provide the group with an organisation chart for the site.
Actioned by way of a chart added to the company's website.

Action 2 – A. Cave to review the website content. Unsure if this has been done as A. Cave was not in attendance at the meeting – therefore carry forward.
Action: Carry forward to the November meeting.

Action 3 – E. LaFace to include a link to the location of the Air Quality Management Plan on the website with the issuing of the Minutes.
Action: Unsure if completed, therefore A. Cave to check and confirm at the November meeting.
Note: A. Cave has confirmed since this meeting that this action was completed.

It was explained that Golden Bay and Winstone Aggregates have now officially combined as one company named GBC Winstone, so eventually the two websites would be merged, and it was confirmed that the Three Kings content would be kept.

Action 4 – W. Hay to follow up with the gardeners to check if the vegetation can be safely removed.
Action: W. Hay confirmed that the vegetation had been cleared to allow access to the viewing portholes.

5. PUBLIC FORUM

Surveyor Access

G. Bryant addressed attendees, confirming that he had contacted Winstone Aggregates requesting access to the Three Kings site in order for surveyors, contracted by the community, to conduct a survey on the quarry slope angle at Three Kings.

Winstone Aggregates advised that the matter was previously investigated in 2008 when they commissioned a report from Graeme Fulton of Terra Mining Consultants Ltd on the quarry slope angle at Three Kings. The report took cross sections across the northern part of the quarry (the part adjacent to Three Kings Reserve) and assessed the slope angle of the quarry pit wall. The report established that the cut slopes of the quarry were in compliance with the Act (Reserves and Other Lands Disposal and Public Bodies Empowering Act 1915). As this issue has been previously addressed, Winstone Aggregates do not deem it appropriate to grant permission for additional work to be done.

G. Bryant again addressed the meeting regarding the survey of the slope cut which is where the haul road is, as he believes the community should be able to commission their own report and have it done properly, i.e. the surveyor only took 3 points, however the area further down where it is steeper was never surveyed, therefore he feels the whole slope of the quarry should be done. It appears to be more than a 40 degree cut. Measurement has been done on part of the Big King, therefore he thinks it should be done further down. The community groups will pay for the survey hence their request for access to the site. It was pointed out that the survey would end up being a peer review.

C. Edmonds responded that Winstone Aggregates perspective is that it is about the bottom of the cut and there are two differences. It is about the toe to the top so the measurements won't change anything.

D. Bellamy asked at what level was the decision made to deny another surveyor access. C. Edmonds replied that Ian Jones, the GBC Winstone General Manager, and Steve Evans of Fletcher Building, had made the decision. G. Bryant said that there is not much point in having these meetings as anything the residents request is rejected.

The Chairman asked if access to a surveyor would impede daily operations? The reply was "yes it would", therefore a survey would need to be carried out after 5.00pm or on a Saturday afternoon.

S. Pearce, Auckland Council, said the 1915 Act is administered by the Department of Conservation. The Auckland City District Plan also notes that The Act is enforced by the Department of Conservation.

D. Bellamy proposed a resolution to write to whomever in the Fletcher organisation to reconsider the request for an independent survey. He also requested clarification of Auckland Council's role. A vote was taken 7 against 1 to have a Resolution to take to the Council. A resident asked that if another survey was carried out, what is that going to alter? G. Bryant said Winstones are infringing the Act and destroying volcanoes.

Moved: D. Bellamy, Seconded: G. Bryant THAT:

In response to the Agenda Item concerning the angle of the quarried western face of the Winstone site and the maximum angles specified in the Reserves and Other Lands Disposal and Public Bodies Empowering Act (1915), the meeting resolves:

1. To express its disappointment at Fletcher's response in denying access to enable an independent survey to be conducted.
2. To request that the company reconsiders its position as has been transmitted by the company representatives at the meeting.
3. To seek the involvement of the Auckland Council in facilitating access to the site and the exchange of data.

Carried

One vote was recorded against the Resolution.

6. SITE MONITORING REPORT

M. Harris, Engineering Geologist, presented his Report (a copy of which is also on the company's website). Points to note include:

Groundwater Level Monitoring

The Borehole Location Plan dated August 2015, with groundwater levels included, was displayed.

Precise Level Survey was undertaken in March-April 2015.

All survey marks were within 5 mm of the March/April Survey.

13 differential settlement alarms occurred.

M. Harris explained the differences in the settlement figures and the relevant action required.

M. Harris also confirmed to D. Bellamy that the three largest are the ones discussed previously. D. Bellamy feels it is a worry as that is on the intersection where the unstable wall is located. G. Bryant suggested pulling the footpath up to ascertain what is happening underneath.

D. Towle noted that this same issue was addressed in September 2014 as recorded in the Minutes. M. Harris confirmed that it has gotten slightly worse. D. Bellamy said this is frustrating as they ask questions and the company just shuts its eyes and does not respond. What is the point of coming to these meetings to see the same data with the same trends over a period of approximately 24 months - with a state of denial from the company that nothing is happening?

It was noted that AP92 has risen +11.47 since the first survey, with all of the other marks declining. M. Harris then explained why footpaths buckle. S. Pearce said Council's scientists have looked at it but have not prepared a report. D. Towle suggested S. Pearce request that a summary report be provided.

Action: S. Pearce request a summary report

S. Pearce pointed out that one of the Council's Officers, who has relevant information, is on 12 months leave, however he will endeavour to obtain the requested information.

There are 3 points out of 267 which are lowering the footpaths. G. Bryant suggested the company be community-minded and fix the footpaths.

The following figures were recorded on Budock Road: AP 117 +10.93, and AP114 +10.97.

A resident then asked if the company is curious as to why this is happening, i.e. the footpaths buckling? M. Harris said the footpaths buckling could be due to tree roots etc.

D. Bellamy commented that the community never get any admission or acknowledgement from the company regarding what is going on, especially regarding the wall he feels is in danger, which they cannot go public about due to reasons explained.

A resident then commented that her wallpaper had buckled at the seams.

AP115 and AP116 are showing a slight trend, as are AP112 and AP113.

M. Harris said that these trend analysis figures are from the study undertaken by Mr Bellamy's friend/colleague.

D. Bellamy then asked whether drilling has been carried out in the area? M. Harris replied that there is a lava flow from One Tree Hill. D. Bellamy added that there is a 'hot spot' on Budock Road which is known to be positioned over Tauranga sediments at the head of an old valley system.

Groundwater Chemistry Monitoring

This commenced in December 2011 following the granting of the Resource Consent to fill the site.

Continuous Groundwater Quality Monitoring

A graph of the pumping bore figures was shown.

Air Quality Monitoring

Two BAM and two Hi Vol monitors are in place on site – the air quality trigger was changed from 80 to 60 micrograms per cubic metre as a 24 hour average. A. Klein explained that there is an automated text reading system and if there is an exceedance over 40, then site staff are alerted, and this continues at approximately 10 minute intervals.

G. Bryant requested something be done over the summer break/Christmas holiday shutdown period regarding dust problems. Meeting attendees requested how long it would take the water cart to cover the current fill area. **Action: A. Klein ascertain an estimated figure for water cart coverage**

Noise Monitoring Results

Testing undertaken on 27th February 2015, with the next scheduled testing due shortly.

7. QUARRY AND FILL OPERATIONS

W. Hay presented his Report. Points to note from this Report, along with A. Klein's input, included:

Maps detailing the current and proposed (over the next 3 months) of where the fill is being stockpiled. All three areas will be used over the next three months, with the placing of fill late September/early October, depending on the weather.

The two remaining commercial tenants on Mount Eden Road are due to vacate their premises in January 2016.

A resident queried what is the current rate of fill that is entering the site? W. Hay responded 40,000 cubic metres per month. In April, almost 60,000 cubic metres of filled was tipped.

D. Taylor again raised the issue of trucks not covering their loads, to which D. Towle responded that we have discussed this subject on several previous occasions. If any residents think there are problems with trucks' loads, they are welcome to call the Police and report it.

Eleven possums have been trapped since the last meeting. G. Bryant suggested trying to work out a joint venture with other local organisations regarding possum trapping, therefore he will send A. Klein contact details.
Action: G. Bryant forward A. Klein details on possum trapping

Daily truck movements averaged at 158 per day over the last six months; with the maximum permitted under the Consent being 375. D. Bellamy suggested A. Kline speak to other Fletcher Divisions about current fill rates and their relation to permitted truck movements per day, as he was at a recent Reserves Act hearing where Steve Evans spoke on this subject but may have had his facts wrong.

Action: A. Klein speak to S. Evans re truck movements

Angela Klein then explained why the nickel figure had risen.

D. Bellamy queried that due to stockpiling, how does Winstones determine where fill is eventually placed? He was concerned that the repositioning (and mixing) of material may lead to difficulty in locating site (s) of excessive leaching- should that occur at some stage in the future..

Four Incidents/Complaints received over the last three months were outlined and discussed. G. Bryant suggested Winstones staff regularly clean the gutters on Mt Eden Road. W. Hay responded that it will be carried out regularly. **Action: W. Hay ensure the gutters on Mt Eden Road are cleaned regularly**

G. Bryant asked what A. Klein's qualifications were. She responded by outlining the various Degrees she held, and where she had previously been employed.

8. GENERAL BUSINESS

None.

9. NEXT MEETING

Monday 30th November 2015, 7.00 pm

Meeting declared closed at 9.10 pm

For more information visit the Winstone Aggregates website www.winstoneaggregates.co.nz
Select <Quarries><Auckland><Three Kings> or go straight to
www.winstoneaggregates.co.nz/Auckland.php?location=Three%20Kings

