

THREE KINGS QUARRY SITE LIAISON GROUP MEETING

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON MONDAY 26TH MAY 2014 AT THE LYNFIELD ROOM, FICKLING CONVENTION CENTRE, COMMENCING AT 7.05 PM

PRESENT:

Winstone Aggregates Attendees:

Tony Carpenter, Andrea Cave, Chris Edmonds, Elyse LaFace, Daniel Le Roux

Elected Representative Attendees:

Councillor Cathy Casey, Albert-Eden-Roskill
Lee Corrick, Albert-Eden Local Board
Harry Doig, Puketapapa Local Board
David Holm, Puketapapa Local Board
Michael Wood, Puketapapa Local Board

Auckland Council Attendees:

Steve Pearce, Team Leader, Monitoring & Compliance

Residents and Interested Parties:

Professor Dick Bellamy (South Epsom Planning Group), Garry Bryant (Three Kings United Group), Marion Hicks, Allan Kirk, Amanda Levey, Noel Moyle, Pip Mules (South Epsom Planning Group), Jill Segedin, Dawn Taylor, Mary Ann White, John White, Chrissie Wright

More were in attendance but did not sign the register.

David Towle (Chairperson/Facilitator)
Sandra Kelly (Minute Taker)

1. WELCOME BY CHAIR

Andrea Cave (Winstone Aggregates) thanked everybody for attending. She advised that Greg McKeown has stood down from the role of Chairperson. She acknowledged the company's thanks to Greg for all of the hard work he has done at these meetings. The Group followed this with a round of applause for Greg.

Andrea Cave then introduced David Towle who will fill the Chairperson role. Andrea reiterated that the Chairperson's role is independent of Winstone and that David lives outside of the Three Kings catchment area. On behalf of Winstone, Andrea extended a welcome to David. David replied that he was delighted to assume the Chairperson's role, and gave a brief introduction of himself including that he is a practicing lawyer/barrister and a trained mediator. He added that his role as Chairperson at these meetings is not to make decisions but to facilitate fair, open communication and discussion.

David Towle then formally opened the meeting and sought apologies.

2. APOLOGIES

Alan Bigelow (Three Kings United Group), Joan Brock, Alison Brown, Michael Brown, Robin Duke, Councillor Christine Fletcher, Mike Harris (Winstone Aggregates), Greg McKeown.

Moved: David Towle, THAT the Apologies be accepted.

Carried

3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

David Towle asked that someone in attendance at the previous meeting move that the minutes of the meeting dated 24th February 2014 be accepted as a true and accurate record.

Moved: Councillor Cathy Casey, Seconded: Andrea Cave.

Carried

4. MATTERS ARISING / ACTION ITEMS

A summary of actions from the previous meeting minutes were listed on the back of the revised agenda. Each of the actions were read out by the Chair and discussed by the Group:

Action 1 – Michael Wood to follow up with Nigel Turnbull regarding the safety investigation of the Mt Eden Rd / Mt Albert Rd intersection with Council Officers.

Michael Wood advised that he had not received further information and will continue to follow up. It was agreed that this item can be held and discussed at the next meeting.

Action 2 – Mike Harris to prepare in presentation format a summary of the Slope Stability report.

It was noted that this will be addressed in the Site Monitoring Report.

Action 3 – Elyse LaFace to request that the noise monitoring consultants undertake the next round of biannual monitoring from 7.00 a.m.

Elyse confirmed this was arranged for the next round of monitoring booked for June 2014.

Action 4 – Daniel Le Roux to review the maintenance of the Mt Eden Road bund.

Daniel Le Roux confirmed that gardeners have completed a tidy up of the bund and that this will be ongoing as it has been added to the gardeners' schedule. The schedule has a list of items that need to be done over the two days a month that the gardeners are engaged to be onsite.

The Group queried if two days per month is insufficient time for the gardeners to conduct such maintenance and requested the company to look into this.

Garry Bryant noted that further work could be undertaken: remove dead wood and branches that have been left along the boundary, clean-up of the rubbish along the fence line, disposal of pipes at the southern end of site. Garry also noted that footholds were again observed nailed to the fence to create access to the site and that it took three weeks for them to be removed.

Furthermore, Harry Doig said he noticed that the two large oak trees on the Mt Eden Bund are dying. Daniel to ascertain what is going to happen to them and report back to the next meeting.

Action 1: Daniel Le Roux to provide details of the Gardeners' schedule at the next meeting and to review if two days a month is sufficient for the works required.

Action 2: Daniel Le Roux to review the state of the oak trees along Mt Eden Bund.

Action 5 – Elyse LaFace to query the accredited agency that undertakes the groundwater chemistry testing about the error associated with each of the parameters.

Elyse LaFace advised that she had queried Hills Laboratories which stated that the most sensitive testing was being undertaken for each parameter. She also noted this was discussed with Council that stating the reporting value without error was industry standard for this type of monitoring.

Professor Dick Bellamy said one needs an idea of the reliability of the measurement, therefore does not find the answer provided to be satisfactory.

Steve Pearce as the Council's representative at the meeting, said that he was aware that the item had been discussed with the appropriate Council Officer but that he was not familiar with the specifics.

Professor Dick Bellamy suggested that a statement in writing from the laboratory be provided.

Action 3: Elyse LaFace to provide further details on the item of reliability of measurement in relation to the groundwater monitoring.

Actions 6 – Steve Pearce to pass on the concerns raised by the Group to Council should an application be made by Winstone to alter the monitoring requirement of the groundwater take consent.

Steve Pearce confirmed that no application had been received. However he has passed on the concerns raised at the last meeting regardless.

John White reiterated the comments from the last meeting being that any changes to this monitoring regime would be detrimental to the understanding of the historic data.

Andrea Cave confirmed that progress of the application to the take consent has been placed on hold following the concerns raised by the Group at the last meeting.

David Towle queried that should Winstone in the future wish to progress the application the Group would be notified at this forum. Andrea Cave confirmed that this would be the case.

Actions 7 and 8 – no further comments raised; however, it was noted that Action 7 (end use consultation strategy) would be discussed under General Business.

5. PUBLIC FORUM

David Towle requested that notice of items for discussion under Public Forum were provided in advance so that they can be added to the Agenda.

Councillor Cathy Casey noted that she would like to discuss the end use of the site but agreed this item is raised under General Business.

6. SITE MONITORING REPORT

In Mike Harris' absence, Tony Carpenter presented the Site Monitoring Report (a copy of which was posted on the Company's website). Points of note include:

- Zinc in Borehole 7 was above the trigger level during the March 2014 monitoring, however the re-test was under the trigger. Therefore, no further actions were required as stated in the relevant consent condition.
- Garry Bryant asked why only two boreholes are tested. Tony Carpenter replied that is what is required in the Consent.
- Professor Dick Bellamy noted he was not satisfied with the summary of the slope stability report that was provided by Mike Harris and presented by Tony Carpenter in the Site Monitoring Report. As such Professor Dick Bellamy requested a copy of the report. It was suggested that the report could be posted on the website.

Action 4: Tony Carpenter to follow up with Mike Harris regarding making the slope stability report available.

7. QUARRY AND FILL OPERATIONS

Daniel Le Roux and Elyse LaFace reported on current quarry and fill operations (a copy of their presentation was posted on the company's website). Points of note include:

- Map of the site detailing current fill areas and proposed fill areas over the next 3 months was displayed and discussed.

One area depicted was where the floor was being pulled up as it contained useable product that was being processed. The build up of this product is a result of years of stockpiling in the area.

Garry Bryant asked who is advising Winstone which areas to fill. Professor Dick Bellamy also queried this. Winstone responded that they make the decision and are currently stockpiling fill in the northern end of site. Elyse LaFace when queried explained that this complies with the Fill Management Plan which details the procedure for acceptance and monitoring of fill that comes into site.

A question was asked about the compaction of fill and if Winstone were currently compacting the material. Daniel Le Roux replied not yet but a small area of rubble is being placed at the southern corner of the site and this is being signed off by Engineers.

Chris Edmonds added that there is only a compaction standard for the upper 5m of fill. Chris also noted that fill is currently being stockpiled while the Company awaits progression of the discussions on the end use of the site. Professor Bellamy suggested that this may result in Winstone's having to re-excavate parts of the site which seems an unusual situation.

- Harry Doig asked that, at future meetings, could Daniel Le Roux please report on the monthly average totals of fill. Daniel responded that the average was between 20,000 and 25,000 tonne per month. It was then queried what this was in cubic meters to which Tony Carpenter responded that the conversion is approximately 2.3 tonne per cubic meter.

Action 5: Daniel Le Roux to include monthly fill volumes to future Quarry and Fill Operations Reports.

8. GENERAL BUSINESS

End Use of the Site

Professor Dick Bellamy commenced the discussion by asking Andrea Cave about a letter sent to the Group dated 1st May 2014 regarding Winstone appointing Fletcher Developments as their agents for the development of the site, however he was not sure why he received the letter, and was dismayed to notice a disclaimer at the bottom stating it cannot be taken as Company policy. He added the Company is making it difficult to know who residents should talk to regarding the future end use of the site and the impacts of this on the fill material being brought into and handled onsite. If there is an internal Company decision on who can discuss what, residents would like to know who these people are so as not to waste their time; especially in relation to consultation which is a two-way process. Professor Dick Bellamy noted that nobody has contacted South Epsom Planning Group regarding end use in a manner that would meet the definition of consultation.

David Towle asked for clarification from Winstone who was making the decisions on the site, to which Chris Edmonds replied that Fletcher Developments were leading the process on the final contour of the site and end use while Winstone Aggregates are operating the current daily activities of the site. Professor Dick Bellamy stated that the consents for the site are in Winstone's name and there is nothing mentioned about

Fletcher Developments which is a newly formed group of Fletcher Building. He added that the handling of this process is again an example of corporate arrogance and shows a lack of good faith.

Andrea Cave advised she understands the concerns raised and held robust discussions with Fletcher Developments after the last meeting in order to clarify the situation. She added she has authority regarding the fill consent on a daily bases but does not have any on the end use.

Mary Ann White suggested Bernie Chote of Fletcher Developments be invited to future meetings so that he can answer residents' questions directly.

David Towle suggested the meeting needs a clear answer from Winstone on this point. As such, the Group produced the following motion:

That this meeting expresses its dissatisfaction and deep concern at the lack of consultation undertaken by Fletcher Building and its subsidiary operating units concerning the management and future end use of the Three Kings Quarry. This meeting calls upon senior Fletcher management to clarify its internal reporting lines and identify clearly the roles and responsibilities of its various employees so that the community can unequivocally identify to whom its serious concerns should be addressed. This meeting further calls senior management to attend the next and future meetings of this Group to hear and discuss all concerns in order to meet the Company's obligations and consultation for existing and future use under the RMA.

Moved: Professor Dick Bellamy, Seconded: Mary Ann White

Carried

It is noted that all representatives from Winstone abstained from voting on the above Motion.

Action 6: Andrea Cave to pass the above request on to the relevant senior management.

Councillor Cathy Casey requested that she be provided both plans that are available on the end use as she is only aware of one plan. It was clarified by Garry Bryant that Fletcher Developments had produced two plans: one of which includes land swaps with the Council and the other which does not. Both plans show a contour level below that of Mt Eden Road.

Harry Doig stated that the existing Resource Consent remains in place. He noted that condition 77 of the consent refers to the consultation process and timeframe required to be followed in this regard.

Action 7: Chris Edmonds to ensure the available plans are provided to Councillor Cathy Casey.

9. NEXT MEETING

Monday 25th August 2014, 7.00 pm

Meeting declared closed at 8.45 pm

For more information about the site and Site Liaison Group Meetings got to: <http://threekingsquarry.co.nz/>